

“Histories of Science in Africa” Season 1 Episode 1:  
*Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston

April 7, 2021

**Episode Summary:**

In this episode guest Julie Livingston discusses the direction that her academic scholarship has taken over the years and her consideration of the past, present, and future. Drawing on her latest book, *Self-Devouring Growth: A Planetary Parable as Told from Southern Africa*, we discuss relationships between people, animals, and the earth. We explore the implications that technological growth in pursuit of economic growth has for metaphysical understandings of the world and its future.

**0:16**

**Conor Wilkinson (CW):** You’re listening to *Histories of Science in Africa*, a podcast supported by the Center for Science and Society at Columbia University.

**0:23**

**Jessie Cohen (JC):** Our guest today is Julie Livingston, Silver Professor of Social and Cultural Analysis and History at New York University. Her work is at the intersection of history, anthropology, and public health. Her research focuses on the body, interspecies studies, gender, development, economic growth and de-growth, and public health.

**0:40**

**CW:** So Julie, if we could have you just talk a bit about your work over the course of your professional career, and especially about where this most recent book is coming from; how it perhaps is in conversation with or builds on the earlier stuff that you’ve done, and also what’s new.

**0:54**

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, “Histories of Science in Africa” Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

**Julie Livingston (JL):** So the book that I'm here to talk about, I think, is *Self-Devouring Growth*. This is my third book. My first book was called *Debility and the Moral Imagination in Botswana*, and it is a social history – a culturally informed social history – of the experience of debility in twentieth-century Bechuanaland, then Botswana. It begins with the present. It starts with an ethnographic present, then it goes back to tell the history that culminates in that present and so it's really looking at the effects of industrial capitalism on the human body, on relationships of care. In addition to industrial capitalism, European colonialism on systems of healing, public health, and the ways that people take care of one another.

I'll just back up and say, generally when people ask me, "What do you do?" I say "I'm a scholar" and they say "of what?" I don't always say I'm a historian, although I am—I'm not trying to hide it [laughs]—but sometimes they think I'm an anthropologist, which I also am. So I'm just—and I have a degree in public health—kind of a cross-disciplinary "mush-mess-person."

But this book came out of my dissertation which was for a History Ph.D. So, it is a work of history and the reason that I said all that before was to say that I don't usually identify myself as a historian of science, I consider myself to be a scholar of the human body. So, this was really about the body and different ways that our bodies make us vulnerable; different ways that bodies are valued and taken care of; and how people live in embodied ways in the face of industrial capitalism, et cetera.

So then the second book that I wrote changes from a little bit of the ethnographic present and a lot of the history that culminates in that present to look at the present and does a little bit of the history that leads there. So that book is called *Improvising Medicine*. It's an

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

ethnography of what at the time was the only cancer ward in Botswana and it tries to look at the cancer ward as a space in which to continue to stay with the body and stay with industrial capitalism which of course is carcinogenic. And to try and understand different forms of injury, care, public health, medicine, that culminated in the cancer epidemic that, at the time I was writing, was rapidly emerging in the Global South—I don't even think we need to say "rapidly emerging" anymore. I think we can just say "thoroughly expressed" and "sedimented" across the Global south, even though a lot of the health systems in those places and global oncology – which didn't used to exist – didn't recognize that there would be cancer in such sites and didn't necessarily have services for it.

And the hinge between those two books is the AIDS epidemic. So the first book culminates in the AIDS epidemic. I did all my research at the height of it and that was productive of really profound forms of debility for people and transformed relationships of care and public health systems and metaphysics and all sorts of things. And then the cancer epidemic is a sequela of the AIDs epidemic. And the AIDS epidemic also brought tons of capital, technology, expertise, all kinds of relationships through the AIDS industry to Botswana and transformed the health system in the process.

And then the third book, if the first one was about the past with a little bit of the present, and the second one is about the present with a little bit of the past, the third one is about the future with some of the present. And I think that will probably complete the work that I do in Botswana. And it expands outward to look at what I think is the next frontier of public health: the body; caregiving, all these questions that concern me in Botswana; the moral imagination which is something I've been interested in since my dissertation and that is the

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

ways in which, again, industrial capital is terra-forming: has remade the landscape, remade the relationships between species, produced relationships of toxicity that exceed those that I saw in relationship to cancer in a really broad-based kind of way and tries to understand what that horizon will look like. So, all three of those works are, I think somehow—they come out of the fact that Botswana is an interesting place, it's a unique place. All places are unique. But it's unique in a particular way and that particular way has to do with how badly they were screwed over, chewed up, spit out, and pillaged by European colonialism. But then, at the same time, their tremendous success in building their post-independence economy, state-run systems, institutions, infrastructure and technology et cetera.

**6:50**

**CW:** So I guess, intentionally or not, this has sort of turned out to be a Botswana trilogy. And it was nice to hear you go over the three phases in terms of, they're all interconnected obviously, but there's a different temporal alignment for each. Although the moral imagination and the effects of modern capitalism run through all three, there's a different set of questions in each work as well.

Could you tell us a bit—the title of the book itself *Self-Devouring Growth*—is this a term that you've been working out for a long time? Is this a term that came up in the midst of the last decade, the last several decades? Something that you developed yourself or in combination with others? And if you could perhaps briefly, I think the American term is to give the Cole's notes? Or the Cliff notes, is the American term. Yes, if you could just give us a bit of background on *Self-Devouring Growth* as a concept.

**7:53**

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

JL: So “self-devouring growth” is a term that I think, probably, I owe to my partner, Behrooz Ghamari-Tabrizi. At some point, when I was like, “Read this, what do you think about...” and we were like hashing out, he may have been the one who came up with that term, or maybe it was me. I’m not sure. But it’s entirely possible that it was him. But it’s a term that emerged pretty far into the process of writing that book. I didn’t intend to write a book. I got invited to give a talk at the *Johannesburg Workshop in Theory and Criticism*. They had particular parameters around the kind of talk that they wanted that had to do with the theme of the seminar. And so, I wrote a paper about rain-making. And that became what is chapter one of the book. And when I presented it there, I got really good feedback and I also got a lot of enthusiasm and interest from people that I should keep going. And it wasn’t framed around growth at the time. It was really framed around transitions in metaphysics which is the undercurrent of the book. And then when I kept going, the first chapter is about the transition from rain-making as a water distribution system to hydraulic technologies: pumps and pipes and dams and things as a water distribution system.

Then I moved on to try to write another chapter using another core metaphysical object/entity/domain in Botswana as a mode of trying to understand what was happening in terms of transformations to the physical environment, and the metaphysics that accompanied it. And cattle are really so paradigmatically important and valued and fascinating beings in Botswana. So that led to the writing of the second chapter. And as I was researching it, I realized that it connected directly to the first chapter, and then the logic of it started emerging because it turned out that the cattle were drinking down the water table and they were contributing to the problems that were elucidated in the first chapter. Then eventually, the

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, “Histories of Science in Africa” Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

cattle were being hit by people who were driving and the cattle were crossing the road. And also, people were transferring some of their passion, some of the value, some of the desire around cattle that they once had to automobiles and cars which is the subject of the third chapter.

What does *Self-Devouring Growth* mean? It's just referring to the fact—it's a term that refers to the ways that, this is what I call it in the book, the ways that the superorganism of human beings is consuming itself. And I will say that even though I invoked Behrooz [Ghamari-Tabrizi] earlier, he can't stand that term 'superorganism of human beings' so nobody should blame him for that. That's me. By which I mean that there's a horizon beyond which our material relationships that undergird, or are the processes of development, are eviscerating to the planet and they have a horizon in which they're no longer possible: where resources dry out, or relationships tip on themselves, and become eviscerating.

So, much to my deep unhappiness, I began to discover that those relationships were everywhere. In Botswana, a place that I really love and respect—I mean there are so many reasons to respect it—but one of them is this very successful development trajectory by which they've been attempting to lift up people who are living near the bottom and provide nets underneath them. And they're living near the bottom at least in part because of the predations of colonialism and industrial capitalism that came before them. So, to realize that that was eviscerating was disturbing. And then to realize "Oh! Well it's not just Botswana, it is everywhere." And so, if the first two books were connected to their region, this book is connected to global capitalism through supply chains. It tries to make a scalar argument about

global capitalism from the intimacies on the ground all the way up to its largest iteration in the climatic systems of the planet.

**12:30**

**JC:** And one of the things both Conor and I both noticed in your book is that you have a lot of references to science fiction, particularly Octavia Butler. So I just wanted to ask you a little bit about the ways that you use the structure of a parable to make your points and how you decided upon that.

**12:28**

**JL:** Absolutely. And thank you for noticing that. I started writing it as a parable in part—I'm interested in writing and form and I was trying to think about a different kind of form. I started writing a series of essays, then those essays were linked and then I realized that I actually want there to be an explicit lesson here in the parable sense. I want to be able to cause the reader to recognize that they are imagining different scenarios, different possibilities and to think in that way. And so parable was at least a part of that. And I'm interested in the essay form in particular because as you go in an essay, you can meander down tangents – forks in the road – as you see little, shiny objects in the corner, you can follow your nose to them and open out new vistas. And you wind up finding all this connective tissue that undergirds the hub of what you're looking at. I think it's a really curious and fascinating form that's very freeing while maintaining control over the analytic trajectory that you're following.

And in linking the essays together into a parable form, I realized, or I hoped anyway, that I could retain that feeling of curiosity, while at the same time doing a couple of things.

Parables, I think, allow you to talk about one place in its detail and particularity while at the

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

same time referring to all of the other places where there's a family resemblance and this feels uncannily familiar and, "That might be a lesson for me too." It is a different kind of way of working with scale and I think it's potentially interesting and politically important to me to think of African contexts as being the hub of that kind of knowledge rather than always being reduced to their particularity or being used as somehow a sign of some kind of abject situation. Whenever Africa's universalized, it's often out of the abject.

Instead, to say, "Well, you want to understand the global condition, we can clearly understand it by looking at this place in Southern Africa." So I was committed to a parable, and then at some point I was somewhere giving a talk. Jennifer Wenzel was there and she was like, "Julie, did you know this thing about a parable: that it's like a parabola in shape." And so she informed me what a parable was structurally, as a form of writing, and that was incredibly fascinating to me and helpful. So a parable is a parabola and when you are reading a parable or writing one, you go out along a plane and then you go up and down in the shape of the parabola. And as you unbend it, the journey takes an unforeseen arc to it, and in the process of travelling that arc, you get new perspectives along the way. So I thought that was really great.

And it wasn't until I was fully committed to a parable and deep in trying to write a parable that I wound up reading Octavia Butler's parable pair. I mean I like Octavia Butler anyway, but there are many people who are way more into speculative fiction than me. I mean I like speculative fiction, I think it's fascinating, I did just refer to us living here in Gilead, which I think we sort of do. But it is the fact that she had written this pair of parables that caused me to sit down and return to her. And they're just so brilliant, and they're so spot on, and they're so



ahead of the time. They're so prescient. I cannot get over this magic, genius, brilliant pair of books that was handed to us – mere mortals – that we get to learn from.

So, I think there's something about speculative fiction as a domain of fiction – maybe different forms of science fiction that are more abstracted, more fantastical, not tethered to the current reality – but are less useful to me for purposes of this book anyway, or purposes of understanding where we are at and what's possible than speculative fiction which begins from our shared present and then tries to imagine some what ifs that are still tethered to that shared present. So it's not the same jump as reading Ursula Le Guin, for example, who is also super brilliant and is very helpful to think with but in a really different kind of way. And Octavia Butler also is writing about California in that pair of parables, and I think California and Botswana share a lot of—California and Botswana are very, very different—but California and Botswana share some water challenges, some rolling blackouts and load shedding, some different kinds of relationships that make California look really familiar to me from Botswana, so it also makes it easier to think with in that respect.

**18:33**

**CW:** Talking about speculative fiction, science fiction, S.F. as an acronym, it reminds me of Donna Haraway's latest book about the Chthulucene and obviously foundational work in STS [Science and Technology Studies], and now this more recent work that starts to delve into the newer multispecies stuff. So one question is: are interspecies and multispecies interchangeable synonyms? Sometimes people who are identifying themselves as multispecies scholars will then use the word interspecies in their prose. The other question that I wanted to ask is: I know you offered a class on interspecies at NYU [New York University], and I wondered if you could talk a

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

bit about what strands of scholarly literature or other publications, stuff like that, that have really spoken to you, found enlightening. Are you more influenced by people coming from a sort of STS background, or are you more interested in the new materialism stuff, Jane Bennett and others? The way I got into it was theorists in archeology and anthropology, trying to do stuff with Heidegger's phenomenology about becoming-with-others, and dwelling with other-than-humans. So I just wondered if you could talk about where the inspiration comes from and what you have found helpful, and what you think this multispecies or interspecies perspective brings to your work and especially to *Self-Devouring Growth* in Botswana.

**19:58**

**JL:** I co-edited a special issue of the journal *Social Text* with my super brilliant, beloved friend and colleague, Jasbir Puar, on the theme of interspecies that came out maybe a decade or so ago. I imagine that just as we were busy working on that, interspecies, at the same time they [Eben Kirksey and Stefan Helmreich] came out with a special issue on multispecies and they came out around the same time. Theirs may have come out before ours, but I don't think either of us knew the other were working on it. And they both are interested in – I'm not saying that that determines what these terms mean – but to say that I think that in our particular domains of scholarship, the fact that these two special issues came out around the same time and had those terms is part of why we are left with different terms. The term 'interspecies' to me though is what I mean. I'm interested in relationships basically. All my scholarship is about relationships. I think the human body is a relationship. *Self-Devouring Growth* – its method is basically to track relationships. And interspecies marks a modality of looking at relationships between species.

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

Multispecies strikes me as expanding the anthropological and eventually other disciplinary purview beyond the human to also look at other species and to try to understand things about their nature and the way that they are organized or socialized, et cetera, which often brings humans into the mix. But the primacy is not to explore the relationship itself, though that may often be part of what happens along the way. But that's what I understand the differences between the two. Others may see it differently, or maybe a meaningless difference. It's not like a hobby horse I would ride into the sun, but it is to say that we didn't just accidentally call it interspecies rather than 'lots of species' or something like that.

And you're right. I do occasionally get to teach a grad class called 'Interspecies'. I hope I will again at some point. Right now, I teach a class – I co-teach it with Professor Miriam Ticktin who's just so brilliant, I wish everyone could get to take a class with her, including me! – on the commons that has a bunch of interspecies stuff in it. So interspecies just emerges everywhere at this point. But there are a lot of different ways of looking at it that I'm interested in. I think one of the things you guys have probably noticed from talking to me thus far is that I'm a highly disorganized thinker. And I'm a kind of disorganized and promiscuous reader. I'm not that super careful, patient, brilliant historian who pins down all of the details and goes deep into some of the scholastic arguments, and parses the theory just so. I really respect those people, but those are not capacities I have. I'm a little bit more woolly than that.

So the things that interest me don't fit into camps and zones. I really could care less about any of that. I don't feel responsible to it. I don't really care about disciplines, I don't care about their debates, I don't care about who likes the word ontology and who thinks it's culture with materiality. I just don't care. But there are really fascinating bodies of work out there. Here

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

are some of them that I like: I really like Robin Wall Kimmerer who wrote the book *Braiding Sweetgrass*, and she is a biologist, a specialist in botany, but also an Indigenous woman who is bringing Indigenous knowledge and plant biology together. I think her work is really, really brilliant and I only discovered it a few months ago and I wish that I had read it before I wrote my book. It's really, really brilliant.

I like the work of this man Reviel Netz, N-E-T-Z, who's a classicist at Stanford and he wrote this book called *Barbed Wire*, and I [laughs] – every unfortunate student who has ever had to work with me is like, “Ugh, here comes the moment where she gives me *Barbed Wire*, and is like ‘Here I’m going to blow the lid off of everything.’” But for some reason, it makes everything make sense to me and it really is tracing this technology of barbed wire as a military technology but also as a technology for controlling the movement of cattle. So you start to see how the prison camp and the slaughterhouse and whatever fit together through the terra-forming relationships that barbed wire produces.

I love, love the work of this Belgian philosopher, Vinciane Despret, who writes about animals and asks the most brilliantly curious questions ever. I'll just mention a few more. I don't know – there are so many people who I think are so fascinating. Obviously, anybody who is listening to this who hasn't read Anna Tsing, like, why are you listening to this? Run out and read Anna Tsing! There's a student I work with, and it seems strange to even call her a student because she's about to defend her dissertation in a month, which is going to be amazing, and she's already written this really beautiful book. Her name is Sunaura Taylor, and she's a scholar of disability and animals, and she thinks about them together. So her first book is called *Beasts of Burden* and it's about disability and animality together. But really what I'm referring to in this

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, “Histories of Science in Africa” Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

context is her dissertation, and the book that will come out of it, that looks at disability in relationship to landscape. She's looking at the aftermath of the toxic spill by the Hughes aircraft corporation in Tucson, Arizona in the '80s which then produced all kinds of negative health effects including congenital disability among many people who were living in areas where the aquifer was polluted. She then traces the landscape and the human being via the aquifer together in ways that I think are just really generative and fascinating.

I like the work of this woman, Kristina Lyons, who writes about the care of the soil, the *selva*, in Colombia in areas where the U.S government has just sprayed so much pesticide and defoliant as part of the war on drugs that they've basically created a criminalized landscape. And then farmers in the area have to try to care for and remediate that landscape as best as possible in order to live among it. And her work is just really careful and feminist and just absolutely fascinating. And I like Juno [Salazar] Parreñas who writes about orangutan rehabilitation. And Radhika Govindrajan who writes about animals in India. I could just go on and on but you know, animals, plants, bacteria, the soil. But I'm also interested in non-speciated relationships among entities. I really like that book by Elizabeth Povinelli called *Geontologies* which is about rocks and I think is totally fascinating. And Hugh Raffles writes about rocks and he's just so magically smart and interesting. I just think there's so much good work out there.

**28:11**

**CW:** Yes, I really enjoyed reading Hugh Raffles as well, and speaking of rocks: that book by Carolyn Dean, *Culture of Stone*, looking at Inka perspectives on rock.

**JL:** No, I haven't read that! I'm going to write it down.

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

**CW:** It's fantastic, definitely right up your alley.

**JL:** Great. I just think it's interesting how the interspecies and multispecies stuff really began out of a move towards animal studies and then has opened up into all these other really fascinating domains. And then it comes right back around to history of science, history of medicine, et cetera, because of course we're looking at the interpenetration and coexistence of different organisms; when you think about this move to the human biome, the fact that your throat is like a garden et cetera. It all comes right back around. I mean how can you understand the pandemic we're living in without an interspecies perspective et cetera. Which isn't only to point to a virus, but to point to a whole welter of relationships that just—they're hard to understand or even grasp little corners of without taking that into account I think.

**29:30**

**JC:** This conversation about relationships between people and animals, objects, is reminding me of Actor-Network-Theory. So, I'm wondering if you think that that is a useful analytic or if there are different kinds to think about these different relationships because I've noticed, in my own work, I study family planning in post-independence Ghana, so there's different relationships between people, between objects, between the environment. It all kind of comes together and so I'm really thinking about ways to understand everything in conjunction.

**29:58**

**JL:** That's a good question. Actor-Network Theory was super brilliant, blew the lid off for good reason, and now everybody is going to pick at it and find its problems, which are there.

But there's no point back to the before Actor-Network Theory just because it has some

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

problems in it. That's our job, is to continually think with different analytics and refine them and use the ones that are useful to try to grapple with the data that we have. So if this tool helps you theorize that data, then great. And if it turns out to not help, then it's not helping.

So I don't think explicitly with Actor-Network Theory, I've certainly read it. But I'm confident it's in there. I'm confident that without it, I wouldn't be able to think the things that I do think. But more interesting to me is Tswana metaphysics, more interesting to me is African philosophy, much more interesting to me in animism. And so I do remember when I read Actor-Network Theory when I was a younger scholar thinking, "Oh, well that's interesting, what about ancestors? What about—and like thinking through a whole set—like, What about healing plants that people use that they activate in particular ways in order to X and Y?"

So there's a kind of metaphysics that I'm interested in that you can see inside Actor-Network Theory, but it doesn't quite go there. And you very much see that metaphysics in animism, which was derided as primitivism, which became a dirty work that you can't be that, all that crap. But I disagree with all that crap and animism speaks to me much more than a lot of other metaphysical explanations of the world and how it operates. So to me, that's sort of where I begin; maybe not in a some formal and explicit way but in that sense that acknowledges that there are—the world is far more complex than what I can perceive and that it has energy running through it that I can vaguely perceive but that I'm confident is there and that those relationships, there are people who are able to, and other entities tap into them, and make vitality out of them in ways that are meaningful and directive in the world, that set forth activity and relationships and enable the world to perpetuate, if I could put it that way.

### 33:03

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

**CW:** You've mentioned Tswana metaphysics multiple times. Is there still any room for Tswana metaphysics in this modern and post-independence – and the fact that you're looking at the present into the future in Botswana – is there still any room for Tswana metaphysics whether at the political, or the scientific, or the agricultural, or the social level? Are there still people that make sense of the world using this different model of expertise? Or is it to the point where it's really about scientific expertise in Botswana now?

**33:37**

**JL:** Well, first of all, yes, there is a ton of scientific and particularly technological expertise in Botswana. Botswana, not surprisingly, is a diamond-producing country ... has tremendous geological expertise. And they have a considerable amount of medical and veterinary expertise, et cetera. Yes. It's a highly technical, very modern nation-state. Absolutely and that's the way that things operate. But every system, including here, also has a metaphysics beyond those modern, rational, scientific and techno-scientific modes of address and organization, regardless of the stories they tell themselves about themselves. That's why we're having fights in this country over whose ancestors can be on that statue and whose ghosts live among us and whose ghosts get to rule the day and whose do not.

Right? I mean I could come up with a million examples right here in the U.S of why we don't think in terms of metaphysics [or more accurately we do not acknowledge our metaphysical systems as such]. It's not--we sort of assume that we are actually operating in this hypermodern, rational... But we're not. Or we are, but there is so much more in excess of that that is going on all the time, at every turn. I always say to people, when I was in my twenties – could have been in my thirties – for a decade, the most popular show in the United States of

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>



America was something called *Touched by an Angel* where people every week saw an angel come to them and then their deceased live. You know, I mean there are people who are seeing a vision of a Virgin Mary in the ice freezer where they get their beer, like we can go on and on in multiple domains but some aspects of that metaphysics here in the U.S look very secular. I don't mean to make it sound like it's only a Christian-oriented phenomenon.

And so too in Botswana. So too in Botswana. There's rational, technical expertise. It's being wielded all over the place, but that doesn't ... capacities, and relationships, and dynamics in excess of that that are happening all over the place and some people are well aware of them, other people are ignoring them or are not interested in them, and some people are trying to affect and interact with them. So no, nothing in Botswana looks like it did in 1860 anymore that it does anywhere else. But does that mean that it's an either-or switch metaphysically? No, and I would say that all you have to look at is the ways people care for their dead in every single place in the world to recognize that there are metaphysical systems that are in excess of those realities. So that was a kind of aggressive [laughs] answer to that question in defense of metaphysics, but there it is.

**36:58**

**JC:** How do you see the negotiations of tensions that arise from that playing out into the future?

**JL:** That's an interesting question and I'm not really sure that I have an answer to it. I think that there are some of these deeper, metaphysical aspects of the world in which it operates, which I see as being very distinct from epistemology, so it's not just a set of ideas. It's about the way that world operates, how time works, right? We know that our progressive *telos*

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

here that we live by is a complete myth, but it's a deeply structuring aspect of our reality and there is some aspect of that progressive, temporal myth – that metaphysical *telos* – that you now see quite clearly in Botswana, for example. And I don't think it's a set of ideas, so much as a way that time is inhabited and then operates, and people organize and the world is organized in relationship to it. We could go on across multiple aspects of that. But I think that there are ways in which some of the brilliance of Tswana metaphysics – you can see it being manifest in other places. Like in the chapter that you guys read for today, I talked about this question of interspeciated familiars – that people understand that cows are us, we are them, what we do to them, we do to us. That's why they can stand in for one another in sacrifice.

That's different from how people in India, who are having a lot of political debate and violence around cows, understand the cow. Right? It is not to say that there is only one non-bio-scientific metaphysics of the cow. There can be multiple ones including a sacred one, including one that can become a basis for different kinds of violence, but I do think that aspects of that animism are familiar to people, particularly indigenous people, in multiple locations around the world. And I think that they are starting to recognize and hail one another. I think recognizing that our moral relationships structure the climate is a metaphysical insight that is emerging as a point of recognition in multiple sites around the world. It's just that different people put it into different kinds of language, but they're hailing a similar set of metaphysical relationships that say, "You must have a political system that is moral enough to shape the climate."

So I think that some of that recognition is taking place as our predicament – vis-à-vis the climate, toxicity, and some of those relationships, all of which are manifest in the pandemic –

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

are creating a kind of urgency and points of communication. I've been reading a lot in Latin America recently and it really resonates in so many ways with a lot of what I know from southern Africa. And I also realize that there are big conversations going on among southern African scholars and Latin American scholars for a while now, and now suddenly I get what the basis of that – where some of the animating force of that is coming from.

I mean I think there are points of friction in profound misrecognition that happen across our global systems over and over again, and they happen in localized ways, just profound misrecognition and alienation, even among people who are really proximate to one another, even people who are sharing intimate space with one another. We can see that in our country when we think about domestic labor, all kinds of things. But I, at the same time, think that there is something happening at the scale of the planet that is producing forms of recognition amid those points of misrecognition.

**41:56**

**CW:** Thank you so much. That was really great. Thank you for agreeing to come on.

**JL:** Well I really appreciate it, you guys. And like I said, I know I'm not much of a historian of science so I'm especially excited to have been asked. Thank you so much, and thank you for your questions and next time we'll just have to flip it around and ask you guys some questions.

**JC:** [laughs] Perfect.

**CW:** Thank you.

**JL:** Alright, take care.

**JC:** Bye.

**CW:** Bye.

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>

## References

- Bennett, Jane. 2010. *Vibrant Matter: A Political Ecology of Things*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Butler, Octavia E. 1993. *Parable of the Sower*. New York: Four Walls Eight Windows.
- . 1998. *Parable of the Talents*. New York: Seven Stories Press.
- Dean, Carolyn J. 2010. *A Culture of Stone: Inka Perspectives on Rock*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Despret, Vinciane. 2016. *What Would Animals Say If We Asked the Right Questions?* Translated by Brett Buchanan. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Govindraj, Radhika. 2018. *Animal Intimacies: Interspecies Relatedness in India's Central Himalayas*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Haraway, Donna J. 2016. *Staying with the Trouble: Making Kin in the Chthulucene*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Ingold, Tim. 2000. *The Perception of the Environment: Essays on Livelihood, Dwelling and Skill*. New York: Routledge.
- Kimmerer, Robin Wall. 2013. *Braiding Sweetgrass: Indigenous Wisdom, Scientific Knowledge and the Teachings of Plants*. Minneapolis: Milkweed Editions.
- Kirksey, Eben S., and Stefan Helmreich. 2010. "The Emergency of Multispecies Ethnography." *Cultural Anthropology* 25 (4): 545-576. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1548-1360.2010.01069.x>.
- Latour, Bruno. 2005. *Reassembling the Social: An Introduction to Actor-Network-Theory*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Livingston, Julie. 2005. *Debility and the Moral Imagination in Botswana*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- . 2012. *Improvising Medicine: An African Oncology Ward in an Emerging Cancer Epidemic*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- . 2019. *Self-Devouring Growth: A Planetary Parable as Told from Southern Africa*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Livingston, Julie, and Jasbir K. Puar, eds. 2011. *Interspecies*. Special issue of *Social Text* 29 (1). [https://read.dukeupress.edu/social-text/issue/29/1%20\(106\)](https://read.dukeupress.edu/social-text/issue/29/1%20(106)).
- Lyons, Kristina M. 2020. *Vital Decomposition: Soil Practitioners and Life Politics*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Netz, Reviel. 2004. *Barbed Wire: An Ecology of Modernity*. Middletown: Wesleyan University Press.
- Parreñas, Juno Salazar. 2018. *Decolonizing Extinction: The Work of Care in Orangutan Rehabilitation*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Povinelli, Elizabeth A. *Geontologies: A Requiem to Late Liberalism*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2016.
- Raffles, Hugh. 2020. *The Book of Unconformities: Speculations on Lost Time*. New York: Pantheon.
- Taylor, Sunaura. 2017. *Beasts of Burden: Animal and Disability Liberation*. New York: New Press.
- . 2021. "Disabled Ecologies: Living With Impaired Landscapes." PhD diss., New York University.
- Tsing, Anna Lowenhaupt. 2015. *The Mushroom at the End of the World: On the Possibility of Life in Capitalist Ruins*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Transcript of Season 1 Episode 1 - *Self-Devouring Growth* with Julie Livingston, "Histories of Science in Africa" Podcast

This transcript and accompanying audio are licensed CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0  
For more information please visit <https://hsia.podcasts.library.columbia.edu/>